

Are there International Labour Standards? Case of Migrant Workers' Exploitation in Italy

Yordan Gunawan¹, Muhammad Arya Ansar², Muhammad Fathi³,
Stephanie Devty⁴, Dwilani Irrynta⁵

¹Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta and the Facultat de Dret, Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Spain. E-mail: yordangunawan@umy.ac.id

²Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
E-mail: muhammad.arya.law21@mail.umy.ac.id

³Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
E-mail: muhammad.fathi.law21@mail.umy.ac.id

⁴Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
E-mail: s.devty.law21@mail.umy.ac.id

⁵Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
E-mail: dwilani.i.law18@mail.umy.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The increasingly fierce competition in the world of work has an impact on people getting jobs. The condition makes most people become migrants by traveling to other countries to find a job for a decent life in the future. However, the work that migrant workers get is often not as expected, so the rights of migrants are often not fulfilled. The amount of violence in the world of work and the non-fulfillment of the rights of migrant workers in Italy is an act that violates human rights. Therefore, the authors wrote this article by using normative legal research method to analyze migrant workers in Italy who are exploited by forced labor and the lack of protection regarding the minimum wage for migrant workers and also aims to analyze the role of the International Labour Organization as an organization that protects the rights of migrant workers, including protection from violence and protection of the minimum wage for migrant workers in Italy. The result shows that there is an urgency for Italy to ratify the Minimum Wage Convention on the grounds that it diminishes the exploitation of migrant workers and provides binding legal force for the sake of migrant workers.

Keywords: Human Rights; International Labour Organization; Migrant Workers; Protection of Migrants

Citation: Gunawan, Yordan, Muhammad Arya Ansar, Muhammad Fathi, Stephanie Devty, and Dwilani Irrynta. 2022. "Are There International Labour Standards? Case of Migrant Workers' Exploitation in Italy". *Mulawarman Law Review* 7 (2). Samarinda, ID.:146-57. <https://doi.org/10.30872/mulrev.v7i2.905>.

INTRODUCTION

Working in another country is a goal to get a decent job so as to improve welfare. But often, the work that is obtained is not as expected. The exploitation of migrant workers can take many forms and violations.¹ For instance, the workers in Italy who mostly work

¹Laurance Matte, G., & Jill, H. (2021). "Creative Recourse in Cases of Forced Labour: Using Human Trafficking, Human Rights and Labour Law to Protect Migrant Workers". *International Migration*, 59(2): 126-139.

in the agricultural sector experience forced labor and are unreasonably paid. Many migrant workers are only paid 35 cents euro per hour while those workers usually work up to 12-13 hours per day. This is of particular concern about how migrant workers should be able to obtain their rights in terms of wages and be free from forced labor because exploitation is a crime that violates the rights of migrant workers.

In industrialized countries, there is a need to fill skill shortages in particular occupations. Political and economic instability in some countries, as well as globalization of goods and services, have resulted in a significant increase in the number of migrants.² In this era, there are still many job seekers who do not have the ability both in the field of knowledge and skills to compete with other workers. In addition, the lack of jobs from the country of origin makes job seekers desire to work in other countries by becoming migrants.

The existence of migrants who have a destination in various countries, especially in developed countries, to find work often gets various problems. In addition, the rise of illegal migrants trespassing into other countries as well as victims of human trafficking. A large number of migrants from various countries can be a problem in overcoming the adverse effects of exploitation for migrants, such as the existence of forced labour and the non-fulfillment of the rights of migrant workers. The providers of labor for migrants often imposed inhumane migrants, where many migrants were subjected to forced labor from various sectors, one of which was in the agricultural sector. Workers in the agricultural sector are subjected to bad behavior until there is an exploitation of migrant workers. Accordingly, most migrant workers in Italy work as farm laborers with unclear and ineligible contracts, so they do not have clear legal protection. Industrial agriculture and its migration dependence from a social sustainability perspective are critical because of two major events. First, the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) crisis has shown how dependent modern society is on the agricultural food industry, which in turn, is highly dependent on the annual mobility of thousands of workers. Second, sustainability has become a central concept in European policy.³

The COVID-19 pandemic presents new challenges for migrant workers. Many restrictions on community mobilization have worsened the economy. Also, COVID-19 disturbs migrant workers because most of the migrant workers are workers in the agricultural sector.⁴ The conditions experienced by migrant workers have a very influential impact on their welfare. The purpose of migrant workers to developed countries to get a decent life is inversely proportional to the treatment obtained. In the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention on Human Rights for All Migrant Workers and Their Family Members, no migrant workers or their family members should

² Ali Dehghanpour Farashah & Tomas Blomquist. (2020, February). Exploring employer attitude towards migrant workers: Evidence from managers across Europe. *In Evidence-Based HRM: A Global Forum for Empirical Scholarship*, Emerald Publishing Limited, 8(1): 18-37.

³Yoan, M., A, L., & M, S. (2021). "On the Social Sustainability of Industrial Agriculture Dependent on Migrant Workers. Romanian Workers in Spain's Seasonal Agriculture". *Sustainability*, 13(3): 1062-1079.

⁴David, K. (2020). "Migrant Workers and COVID-19". *Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, 77(9): 634-636.

be subjected to torture or cruel, inhuman, and degrading treatment or punishment so that the exploitation of migrant workers is an act that violates human rights.

This article aims to analyze the protection of Indian migrant workers in Italy due to the large number of exploitations that migrant workers receive by looking at the perspective of international law. Therefore, with these problems, this article is expected to be useful not only as a source of knowledge but also to enforce the protection of migrant workers and overcome the issues in question.

METHOD

This article applied the normative legal research method characterized by collecting and analyzing library research. The sources gave secondary data consisting of primary legal materials, secondary legal materials, and tertiary legal materials.

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

Protection of International Law for Migrant Workers

In the era of globalization, many migrant workers are victimized due to their ignorance of the laws governing labor relations between employers and workers, as well as the civil, political, and economic rights of migrant workers, which are often misused when looking for work in other countries due to the ineffective protection of migrant workers' rights. Many employers take advantage of abusing existing labor relations with migrant workers by hiring them casually. Therefore a sufficient employment agreement is needed that not only benefits the employer for migrant workers.

The rights to work have been regulated in Article 23 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), which states as follows:

1. *Everyone has the right to work, to free choice of employment, to just and favourable conditions of work and to protection against unemployment.*
2. *Everyone, without any discrimination, has the right to equal pay for equal work.*
3. *Everyone who works has the right to just and favourable remuneration, ensuring for himself and his family an existence worthy of human dignity, and supplemented, if necessary, by other means of social protection.*
4. *Everyone has the right to form and join trade unions for the protection of his interests.*

The classification of workers' rights as human rights has the potential to shift the concept of employment from being centered on the dignity of workers to being centered on the dignity of workers. However, the issue of workers' rights as human rights is still a debatable topic. The UDHR maintains the view that workers' rights are important to the scope and understanding of human rights that emerged after 1945.⁵ An important component of that emphasis is the shift in consensus on project workforces from projects that restrict those who use labor for projects—that instill labor rights in people. The first framework touched on working conditions, and the second touched on the

⁵Larry, C. B. (2019). "From the Social to the Human Rights of Labor: Reflections on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights Art. 23, the ILO, and Working Rights Principles". Coalition for Peace and Ethics, Working Paper, (2/1).

rights embedded in individuals; that is, one framed the issues external to actors, and the other internalized those issues within individuals who are now reconstituted as rights bearers rather than objects of obligation. The convergence of two otherwise distinct frameworks involved the convergence of two otherwise distinct frameworks; the first framework touched on working conditions, and the second framework touched on the rights embedded in individuals.

Article 23 of the UDHR defines the four most important aspects of what is now acknowledged to be the basis of workers' human rights. The first is the noncoercion principle. These are the great protection principles against slavery: those who control work cannot control labor; those who can offer employment cannot force employment because capital has no right to demand labor; and labor must be treated fairly, with working conditions (other than remuneration) judged on the principles of dignity and justice as prescribed by the market or the state. The essence of the right is the freedom to choose employment (workers, not those who manage the work, have the right to choose labor) and favorable working conditions. The right to work is rooted in those who work, not those who will employ them. Although the state may not restrict an individual's personal right to labor, it must assume a positive commitment to safeguarding the individual who possesses the right in situations where the individual is not working.

The second is the principle of limited non-discrimination. After employment, all individuals must be paid without regard to foreign conditions or circumstances. It can include any circumstances in the ordinary course that give rise to discrimination—ethnicity, race, religion, gender, political beliefs, etc. However, the anti-discrimination principle did not reach a preliminary decision to hire or avoid individuals into certain forms of labor based on those characteristics with respect to discrimination in the condemned salary.

The third is the principle of a living wage. Fairness is understood by referring to the conditions of the right holder rather than the employer. It creates a double burden, namely on employers to pay fair wages and the state to make a distinction between a fair wage (determined by the market or vice versa) and a living wage determined with reference to the conditions of the holders of their rights and dependents (determined with reference to the family, however it can be defined). The last principle is collective action. Individuals have parallel rights to accumulate their capital and labor. The state should not privilege the right to collective action with capital to the right of workers to do the same.⁶

As a result, there is a large body of international hard law and soft law on work rights, including the rights to full employment and decent work. In particular, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) explains that the right to work in Article 6 of CESCR is an individual and a collective right and “encompasses all forms of work, whether independent work or wage-paid work.” Further, the CESCR maintains that the right to work must be the right to decent work. It defines “decent work” as:

⁶*Ibid.*

“Work that respects the fundamental rights of the human person as well as the rights of workers in terms of conditions of work safety and remuneration. It also provides an income allowing workers to support themselves and their families, as highlighted in article 7 of the Covenant. These fundamental rights also include respect for the physical and mental integrity of the worker in the exercise of his/her employment.”

Most of these rights have been further detailed by the CESCR, which is charged with supervising states in implementing the Covenant by way of General Comments, Concluding Observations on country reports, and Statements.⁷

The ILO is an organization that compiles labor standards to be used as international guidelines and programs to improve the employment and lives of workers. The ILO was one of the first international organizations in the world to be founded after the First World War during the great industrial unrest and the rise of the labor movement.⁸ The Core Convention is at the core of the basic rights of the ILO to achieve social justice that is the foundation for the creation of world peace. At first, it was anticipated that this reform would be undertaken through a progressive process of international standard-setting involving the representatives of governments, workers, and employers.⁹

The ILO has specifically adopted two Conventions that address labor migration. First, in 1949 it was approved by International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention 97 (Migration Convention for Employment), which essentially explains the obligation to ratify each state to exercise equal treatment between migrant workers and their own citizen workers. Each State must have a goal to achieve such goals by signing bilateral agreements that define recruitment procedures and conditions for cross-border employment. Secondly, in 1975 the International Labour Convention (ILO) 143 (Convention on Migrant Workers) was adopted, which affirmed the protection of migrant workers in exploitative situations as well as equal opportunities and integration of settled migrants. This is an effort to motivate each State to abolish the clandestine movement and hire migrant workers.

The United Nations (UN) General Assembly 1990 passed the International Convention on the protection of the rights of all migrant workers and their family members. It was in 2003 when the minimum number of 20 ratifying states was met. After 13 years, this Convention came into force. The definition of migrant workers themselves has been explained in the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention No. 97 states that migrant workers are “a person who migrates from one state to another with a view to being employed otherwise than his own account and includes any person regularly admitted as a migrant for employment”. The point is that a person who migrates from

⁷Gillian, M., & Diane, F. (2018). “Challenging Neoliberalism: ILO, Human Rights, and Public Health Frameworks on Decent Work”. *Health and Human Rights*, 20(2): 43-55

⁸Paul Van Der, H. (2018). “The ILO Stumbling Towards its Centenary Anniversary”. *International Organizations Law Review*, 15(1): 203-220.

⁹Guy, F. S. (2018). A “‘Civilizing Task’: The International Labour Organization, Social Reform, and the Genealogy of Development”. *Journal of the History of International Law/Revue d'histoire du droit international*, 20(2): 145-197.

one country to another with the intention of working for the fulfillment of his rights is referred to as a migrant worker.¹⁰

Then, the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (ICRMW) is the result of these two ILO conventions. This convention was modified from General Assembly Resolution 45/158 on December 18, 1990. However, until 2021 just 56 nations will have ratified this convention, whereas 39 nations have signed it and 103 nations have not. Moreover, ICRMW set standards for international and national laws governing enforcement and legal protections. This convention promotes state relations with the exchange of information, the reduction of illegal migrant labor, migrant labor smuggling, human trafficking, and other rights.

International Labor Organization (ILO) should be used to eradicate all problems, including human trafficking, brutality, slavery, coercion, and other inhumane practices. The ILO ensures that all migrant workers around the globe have legal status, granting them easy access to working permits, amnesty, and other migrant worker-related benefits.¹¹ The 1990 Migrant Convention is a minimum protection standard for migrant workers and their family members.

The 1990 Migrant Convention has its advantages in preventing human trafficking and unsafe migration. Undocumented workers will not get more rights than undocumented ones because every migrant worker with various legal statuses has the same rights. Therefore, any country that consistently exercises the Convention in earnest will have an impact on every citizen who will migrate from the outset already conditioned and directed to work with safety and dignity because the available migration policies and systems are readily available and In each migration area (area of origin, transit, and country of work destination) and all migration statuses (regular/ documented and non-regular/undocumented) a standard guarantee of protection is given to every migrant worker and his family at each stage of migration (preparation, period of work and return).

Efforts to Prevent the Exploitation of Migrant Workers in Italy

Even in fully developed capitalist countries, labor contracting is on the rise,¹² in addition to the economic and social challenges that historically characterized extreme unequal societies.¹³ However, the proportion of rural jobs filled by migrant workers is gradually

¹⁰Darminto, H., & Indranila, K. S. (2021). "Legal Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers: International Law, National Regulations and Contemporary Problems". *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 10: 859-865.

¹¹Mark Westcott & Tien Nguyen (2022) Gender Diversity on Superannuation Trustee Boards in Australia – Evidence from Profit-to-Member Funds, *Labour and Industry*, 32:3, 213-235

¹²Lucilla Salvia. (2019). "The Restructuring of Italian Agriculture and its Impact Upon Capital-Labour Relations: Labour Contracting and Exploitation in the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Supply Chain of the Lazio Region, Central Italy", *Journal of Agrarian Change*, 20(1): 98-112.

¹³ Concepción Anguita, O., & Carolina, S. (2021). "The Case of Migrant Women from the Central American Northern Triangle: How to Prevent Exploitation and Violence During the Crossing". *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 64(2): 1-17.

increasing over time, especially in the agricultural sector.¹⁴ Such a sector in Italy employs over 500,000 migrant laborers, or about half of the country's workforce.¹⁵ Eighty percent of these migrant employees are without contracts, according to the research center Osservatorio Placido Rizzotto, which analyzes the working conditions of those in the agricultural industry.¹⁶ Around 30,000 of the 500,000 migrant workers in Italy's agricultural industry, according to Bhoola's estimate, come from India and Pakistan.¹⁷ A lot of workers from Sub-Saharan Africa, who move from one region to another with the fruit and vegetable harvests, also have the worst working and living conditions. They stay in abandoned houses in the countryside and in "ghettos" (self-built shantytowns or tent-barrack cities), like in the areas of Foggia (Apulia) and Rosarno (Calabria). In many places, this is made worse by the fact that it's hard to find a job without illegal middlemen known as "caporali".¹⁸ They are treated like slaves by landlords and dairy business owners who abuse migrant employees. This practice of illegally hiring and exploiting workers through middlemen is known as "*Caporalato*".

The "*Caporalato*" system is made up of networks of criminal syndicates and mafia organizations that profit from the exploitation of migrant laborers in conditions like slavery, as well as labor brokers who supply regular and irregular migrants to agriculture.¹⁹ *Caporalato* is the Italian term for a system of hiring workers that takes advantage of them and often leads to situations where they have to work for free or are forced to work. These practices are part of a conniving and multi-offensive phenomenon that is operated by *caporali* (illegal recruiters) and facilitated by a long and unethical supply chain with many flaws. *Caporali* forces migrant workers to get all of their basic needs from them: it costs 5 euros to ride in a truck with other workers to the fields, 1.5 Euros for a bottle of access to water, 3.5 Euros for a sandwich, and different extras for other basic needs, like health care.²⁰

In this kind of labor organization, many social and economic relations arise between laborers and *caporales*, as well as among migrant workers who are usually isolated and the communities in which agriculture is practiced. To gain a better understanding of the scope of the *Caporalato* phenomenon, it is important to note that in 2016, 40.3 million people from around the world became victims of contemporary slavery. Slavery itself is a general term that refers to a variety of different types of oppression. Of that amount, 24.9 million people are in some form of forced labor. In addition, women make up 71%

¹⁴ Sona, K., Marco, S., Fabrizio, N., & Alfredo, A. (2021). "Immigration and Integration in Rural Areas and the Agricultural Sector: An EU Perspective". *Journal of Rural Studies*, 88: 462-472.

¹⁵ Yordan Gunawan. (2021). *Hukum Internasional: Sebuah Pendekatan Modern*. Yogyakarta, LP3M UMY.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ Giulio Iocco, Martina Lo Cascio, and Domenico Claudio Perrotta. (2020). 'Close the Ports to African Migrants and Asian Rice!': The Politics of Agriculture and Migration and the Rise of a 'New' Right - Wing Populism in Italy. *Sociologia Ruralis*, 60(4), 732-753.

¹⁹ *ibid*

²⁰ Ruggero Scaturro. (2021). "Modern Slavery Made in Italy—Causes and Consequences of Labour Exploitation in the Italian Agricultural Sector". *Journal of Illicit Economies and Development*, 3(2): 181-183.

of those held in the form of modern slavery, while men make up only 29%.²¹ There are 4.8 million people who have been sexually exploited against their will.²² The agricultural industry is responsible for the exploitation of 3.5 percent of the total number of people subjected to a state of forced labor, and of the total profit of 150 billion Euros obtained from forced labor, 9 billion is the result of exploitation in the agricultural sector. On Italian farms, an estimated 430,000 people are at risk of becoming victims of *Caporalato* because they have irregular and unlawful employment contracts.²³ Of these 430,000 people, 100,000 have been admitted to be in conditions that put them at risk of exploitation.²⁴ The *Caporalato* system consists of labor brokers who supply irregular and regular migrants to farms and a network of criminal syndicates and mafia groups that benefit from the exploitation of conditions such as slavery by migrant workers. Working conditions concern the existence of an employment relationship between workers and farmers but also the process of being able to approve knowledge of the entire process work and the role of each worker in the process itself.²⁵

The convention defines violence and harassment as "a set of unacceptable behaviors and practices" that "aim, result in, or may result in physical, psychological, sexual or economic harm".²⁶ A large number of exploitations against migrant workers is a serious concern for the Italian Government. In fact, the Government has ratified the Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019 (No. 190) since October 29, 2021.²⁷ Convention No. 190 is an international labor standard that deals with violence and harassment in the world of work.

According to a report issued in 2018 by the Italian Trade Union for Farmers, Flai Cgil, and the Placido Rizzotto Research Institute, some workers are paid less than two Euros an hour and have to pay for water, transportation to the fields, and lunch every day.²⁸ One of the migrant workers from India, Singh, stated that he works 12-13 hours a day, including Sundays, with no holidays or breaks.²⁹ Those farmers are only paid 100 Euros to 150 Euros a month or about 35 Cents an hour, whereas the minimum wage for

²¹*Ibid.*

²²*Ibid.*

²³Dana, Domsodi. (2019). "Labour Relations and Labour Structures in Mediterranean Capitalism. Caporalato and Romanian Migration in the Southern Italian Agriculture". *Studia Universitatis Babes-Bolyai-Sociologia*, 64(1): 127-142.

²⁴*Ibid.*

²⁵Francesca, G., Gabriella, R., & Patrizia, B. (2020). "Migrants Workers and Processes of Social Inclusion in Italy: The Possibilities Offered by Social Farming". *Sustainability*, 12(10): 3991.

²⁶Geneva. (2021). Italy Ratifies the ILO Convention (No. 190) on the Elimination of Violence and Harassment in the World of Work. [https://www.ilo.org/rome/risorse-informative/comunicatistampa/WCMS_825453/langen/index.htm#:~:text=ILO%20Convention%20\(No.,190\)%20on%20the%20eliminatin%20of%20violence%20and%20harassment%20in%20the,country%20that%20ratified%20this%20Convention](https://www.ilo.org/rome/risorse-informative/comunicatistampa/WCMS_825453/langen/index.htm#:~:text=ILO%20Convention%20(No.,190)%20on%20the%20eliminatin%20of%20violence%20and%20harassment%20in%20the,country%20that%20ratified%20this%20Convention.). [Accessed on August 1, 2022].

²⁷*Ibid*

²⁸Macgregor Marion. (2021). Secret Slaves: Indian Farm Workers in Italy <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/33595/secret-slaves-indian-farm-workers-in-italy>. [Accessed on August 1, 2022].

²⁹*Ibid.*

workers in the agricultural sector is about 10 Euros per hour.³⁰ Those workers are prohibited from reporting or even complaining. Those workers were harmed doing the work. Their employer concealed this incident and even beat them frequently. Marco Omizzolo, Professor of Sociology at Rome's La Sapienza University, stated that in the past four years, 14 workers from India had committed suicide due to inhumane work and torture from the employers he worked for. In addition to the exploitation of workers forced to work without holidays and with minimum wages, there is ample evidence that the use of Opioids painkillers is widespread among Indians working on the farm. In a 2017 interview with Reuters, workers explained that the reason they had to take medicines was that they had to pick watermelons for up to 13 hours a day with their backs hurting and under the scorching sun.³¹ A recent police operation in Sabaudia City led to the arrest of a doctor who allegedly prescribed more than 1,500 boxes of *depalgos*, a powerful painkiller containing *oxycodone* and given to cancer patients, to 222 agricultural workers in India. Latina Chief Prosecutor Giuseppe De Falco told AFP the drug might allow them to work longer in the fields by relieving pain and fatigue.³²

The ILO has a mission to investigate, promote, or support the existence of opportunities for migrant workers or workers working abroad to obtain decent work for their rights free of charge, in a fair and safe manner, and the ILO Convention has a mission to fulfill the rights of employees in the workplace, enhance social protection, and strengthen the discourse to address issues related to the working world. The ILO provides unrivaled experience and knowledge about the world of work in support of its aims and mission. This expertise and knowledge is helping the ILO's tripartite constituencies and society as a whole in a variety of ways, including:³³

- The development of international policies and programs with the goals of advancing fundamental human rights, enhancing working and living circumstances, and expanding job opportunities
- The establishment of worldwide labor standards supported by a one-of-a-kind system to monitor the application of these standards
- A comprehensive program of international technical cooperation that is developed and carried out in an active partnership with constituents in order to assist nations in putting these policies into practice in an efficient manner.
- Training, education, and research activities that will assist in advancing all of these efforts.

Italy has not ratified the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention of 1970 (No. 131). If Italy ratifies the Minimum Wage Setting Convention, it will provide wage protection to

³⁰Jonathan Sale. (2020) Harmonisation of Labour Laws: An Arduous Journey for ASEAN, *Labour and Industry*, 30:1, 34-65.

³¹Yordan Gunawan *et al.* (2022). "Dispute Resolution Between The Philippines And China: Fishing Activities In The South China Sea". *Revista UNISCI*, 59, 59-73.

³²*Ibid.*

³³International Labour Organization. (2022). Mission and Impact of the ILO. <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/mission-and-objectives/lang--en/index.htm>. [Accessed On August 1, 2022].

migrants with strong legal force, in accordance with the contents of Article 2 paragraph 1, which states that the minimum wage must have legal force and cannot be reduced, and failure to implement it will make the person or persons. The person concerned may be subject to criminal sanctions or other appropriate sanctions. With the ratification of the Convention, the remuneration of migrants in Italy, especially in the agricultural sector, will be better and commensurate with the hard work they do. Collaboration between the community and the police is one of the most effective means of combating serious crimes.³⁴ In addition, it is necessary to hold a campaign regarding the protection of workers to labor providers as well as protection from the country of origin of migrants and regular inspections of citizens working abroad with the aim of being able to avoid exploitation that occurs against their citizens who are abroad.

CONCLUSION

The ratification carried out by Italy regarding the elimination of violence and harassment in the world of work is a means to abolish forced labor in Italy. However, there is still a lot of exploitation of migrant workers, especially migrants from India, which is an act of threatening the welfare of migrants in living life. Wage reduction, forced labor, and violence in the world of work must be wholly resolved because they concern the protection of rights for migrant workers. To address the issue, especially in the field of wages, the urgency to ratify the Minimum Wage Fixing Convention is one of the important instruments and ways, considering that to ensure the fulfillment of wages for workers and with the ratification of the Minimum Wage Convention, it can provide legal certainty and binding legal force for migrant workers so as to prevent exploitation. The ratification of the Convention is also a step to create justice for all migrant workers in Italy.

REFERENCES

- Backer, L. C. (2019). From the Social to the Human Rights of Labor: Reflections on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights Art. 23, The ILO, and Working Rights Principles. Coalition for Peace and Ethics, Working Paper, (2/1).
- Concepción Anguita, O., & Carolina, S. (2021). "The Case of Migrant Women from the Central American Northern Triangle: How to Prevent Exploitation and Violence During the Crossing". *Revista Brasileira de Política Internacional*, 64(2), 1-17. <https://doi.org/10.1590/0034-7329202100205>.
- Domşodi, D. (2019). "Labour Relations and Labour Structures in Mediterranean Capitalism. Caporalato and Romanian Migration in the Southern Italian Agriculture". *Studia Universitatis Babes-Bolyai-Sociologia*, 64(1), 127-142. <https://doi.org/10.2478/subbs-2019-0006>.
- Farashah, A. D., & Blomquist, T. (2020). "Exploring employer attitude towards migrant workers: Evidence from managers across Europe". In *Evidence-Based HRM: A Global Forum for Empirical Scholarship*, Emerald Publishing Limited, 8(1), 18-37. <https://doi.org/10.1108/EBHRM-04-2019-0040>.

³⁴Pradeep, K. S. (2021). "Policing in India: Need of Effective Preventive Actions to Tackle Crime and Criminality". *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 28(2): 136-152.

- Geneva. (2021). Italy Ratifies the ILO Convention (No. 190) on the Elimination of Violence and Harassment in the World of Work. https://www.ilo.org/rome/risorse-informative/comunicati-stampa/WCMS_825453/lang--en/index.htm [Accessed on August 1, 2022].
- Giarè, F., Ricciardi, G., & Borsotto, P. (2020). "Migrants Workers and Processes of Social Inclusion in Italy: The Possibilities Offered by Social Farming." *Sustainability*, 12(10), 3991. <https://doi.org/10.3390/SU12103991>.
- Gunawan, Y. (2021). Hukum Internasional: Sebuah Pendekatan Modern. Yogyakarta, LP3M UMY.
- Gunawan, Y., Irrynta, D., Segura, C.G., Alcaraz, P.P. (2022). "Dispute Resolution Between The Philippines And China: Fishing Activities In The South China Sea". *Revista UNISCI*, 59, 59-73: <http://dx.doi.org/190.31439/UNISCI-141>.
- Hartono, D., & Samsuria, I. K. (2021). "Legal Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers: International Law, National Regulations and Contemporary Problems". *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 10, 859-865. <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2021.10.101>.
- International Labour Organization. (2022). Mission and Impact of the ILO. <https://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/mission-and-objectives/lang--en/index.htm>. [Accessed on August 1, 2022].
- Iocco, G., Lo Cascio, M., & Perrotta, D. C. (2020). 'Close the Ports to African Migrants and Asian Rice!': The Politics of Agriculture and Migration and the Rise of a 'New' Right-Wing Populism in Italy. *Sociologia Ruralis*, 60(4), 732-753. <https://doi.org/10.1111/soru.12304>
- Kalantaryan, S., Scipioni, M., Natale, F., & Alessandrini, A. (2021). "Immigration and Integration in Rural Areas and the Agricultural Sector: An EU Perspective". *Journal of Rural Studies*, 88, 462-472. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2021.04.017>.
- Koh, D. (2020). "Migrant Workers and COVID-19". *Occupational and Environmental Medicine*, 77(9), 634-636. <https://doi.org/10.1136/oemed-2020-106626>.
- Macgregor Marion. (2021). Secret Slaves: Indian Farm Workers in Italy <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/33595/secret-slaves-indian-farm-workers-in-italy>. [Accessed on August 1, 2022].
- MacNaughton, G., & Frey, D. (2018). "Challenging Neoliberalism: ILO, Human Rights, and Public Health Frameworks on Decent Work". *Health and Human Rights*, 20(2), 43-55. PMID: 35068401.
- Matte Guilmain, L., & Hanley, J. (2021). "Creative Recourse in Cases of Forced Labour: Using Human Trafficking, Human Rights and Labour Law to Protect Migrant Workers". *International Migration*, 59(2), 126-139. <https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12743>
- Molinero-Gerbeau, Y., López-Sala, A., & Şerban, M. (2021). "On the Social Sustainability of Industrial Agriculture Dependent on Migrant Workers. Romanian Workers in Spain's Seasonal Agriculture". *Sustainability*, 13(3), 1062-1079. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13031062>.
- Sale, Jonathan. (2020) Harmonisation of Labour Laws: An Arduous Journey for ASEAN, *Labour and Industry*, 30:1, 34-65, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10301763.2020.1723392>

- Salvia, Lucilla. (2019). "The Restructuring of Italian Agriculture and Its Impact Upon Capital–Labour Relations: Labour Contracting and Exploitation in the Fresh Fruit and Vegetable Supply Chain of the Lazio Region, Central Italy", *Journal of Agrarian Change*, 20(1), 98-112. <https://doi.org/10.1111/joac.12340>.
- Scaturro, R. (2021). "Modern Slavery Made in Italy—Causes and Consequences of Labour Exploitation in the Italian Agricultural Sector". *Journal of Illicit Economies and Development*, 3(2), 181-183. <http://doi.org/10.31389/jied.95>.
- Sinclair, G. F. (2018). "A 'Civilizing Task': The International Labour Organization, Social Reform, and the Genealogy of Development". *Journal of the History of International Law/Revue d'histoire du droit international*, 20(2), 145-197. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15718050-20021013>.
- Singh, P. K. (2021). "Policing in India: Need of Effective Preventive Actions to Tackle Crime and Criminality". *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 28(2), 136-152. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jmh.v28i2.12624>.
- Sirait, N. N. (2022). "Legal Protection of International Labor Organization (ILO) and Indonesia Towards Indonesia Illegal Migrant Workers". *Atlantis Press*, 642, 159-164. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.220204.026>.
- Van Der Heijden, P. (2018). "The ILO Stumbling towards Its Centenary Anniversary". *International Organizations Law Review*, 15(1), 203-220. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15723747-01501007>.
- Westcott, M. & Nguyen, T. (2022) Gender Diversity On Superannuation Trustee Boards in Australia – Evidence from Profit-to-Member Funds, *Labour and Industry*, 32:3, 213-235, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10301763.2022.2137937>